Proposed Revision to the Comments to Pa.Rs.Crim.P. 409, 414, 424, 454, and 455

INTRODUCTION

The Criminal Procedural Rules Committee is planning to recommend that the Supreme Court of Pennsylvania revise the <u>Comments</u> to Rules 409, 414, 424, 454, and 455 to clarify that a magisterial district justice may conduct the trial of a defendant who is under the age of 18 and is charged with a violation of 75 Pa.C.S. §1543(b) (driving under a DUI-related suspended license) but the sentence may not include incarceration. *This proposal has not been submitted for review by the Supreme Court of Pennsylvania.*

The following explanatory <u>Report</u> highlights the Committee's considerations in formulating this proposal. Please note that the Committee's <u>Reports</u> should not be confused with the official Committee <u>Comments</u> to the rules. Also note that the Supreme Court does not adopt the Committee's <u>Comments</u> or the contents of the explanatory <u>Reports</u>.

The text of the proposed <u>Comment</u> revisions to the rules precedes the <u>Report</u>. Additions are shown in bold and are underlined; deletions are in bold and brackets.

We request that interested persons submit suggestions, comments, or objections concerning this proposal in writing to the Committee through counsel,

Jeffrey M. Wasileski, Counsel Supreme Court of Pennsylvania Criminal Procedural Rules Committee 601 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 6200 Harrisburg, PA 17106-2635 fax: (717) 231-9521

e-mail: criminalrules@pacourts.us

no later than Friday, November 23, 2012.

October 3, 2012	BY THE CRIMINAL PROCEDURAL RULES COMMITTEE:
	Philip D. Lauer, Chair
Jeffrey M. Wasileski Counsel	

RULE 409. GUILTY PLEAS.

- (A) A defendant may plead guilty by:
 - (1) notifying the issuing authority in writing of the plea and forwarding to the issuing authority an amount equal to the fine and costs specified in the citation; or
 - (2) appearing before the issuing authority for the entry of the plea and imposition of sentence when the fine and costs are not specified in the citation or after receipt of notice that a guilty plea by mail has not been accepted by the issuing authority pursuant to paragraph (B)(3).

.

- (B) When the defendant pleads guilty pursuant to paragraph (A)(1):
 - (1) The defendant must sign the guilty plea acknowledging that the plea is entered voluntarily and understandingly.
 - (2) The issuing authority may issue a warrant for the arrest of the defendant as provided in Rules 430 and 431 if the amount forwarded with the plea is less than the amount of the fine and costs specified in the citation.
 - (3) Restrictions on the acceptance of guilty plea by mail:
 - (a) The issuing authority shall not accept a guilty plea that is submitted by mail when the offense carries a mandatory sentence of imprisonment.
 - (b) In those cases in which the charge carries a possible sentence of imprisonment, the issuing authority may accept a guilty plea submitted by mail.
 - (c) In any case in which the issuing authority does not accept a guilty plea submitted by mail, the issuing authority shall notify the defendant (1) that the guilty plea has not been accepted, (2) to appear personally before the issuing authority on a date and time certain, and (3) of the right to counsel. Notice of the rejection of the guilty plea by mail also shall be provided to the affiant.
- (C) When the defendant is required to personally appear before the issuing authority to plead guilty pursuant to paragraph (A)(2), the issuing authority shall:

- (1) advise the defendant of the right to counsel when there is a likelihood of imprisonment and give the defendant, upon request, a reasonable opportunity to secure counsel;
- (2) determine by inquiring of the defendant that the plea is voluntarily and understandingly entered;
- (3) have the defendant sign the plea form with a representation that the plea is entered voluntarily and understandingly;
- (4) impose sentence, or, in cases in which the defendant may be sentenced to intermediate punishment, the issuing authority may delay the proceedings pending confirmation of the defendant's eligibility for intermediate punishment; and
- (5) provide for installment payments when a defendant who is sentenced to pay a fine and costs is without the financial means immediately to pay the fine and costs.

COMMENT: The rule was amended in 2007 to make it clear (1) that a defendant may not enter a guilty plea by mail to an offense that carries a mandatory sentence of imprisonment, and (2) in those cases in which the offense carries a possible sentence of imprisonment, the issuing authority has the discretion whether or not to accept a guilty plea submitted by mail.

Nothing in this rule is intended to require that an issuing authority should proceed as provided in paragraph (C) when the defendant returns the written guilty plea and the fine and costs in person to the issuing authority's office pursuant to paragraphs (A)(1) and (B). The issuing authority's staff should record receipt of the plea and monies in the same manner as those received by mail.

Paragraph (C)(4) was added in 2007 to permit an issuing authority to delay imposition of sentence in order to investigate a defendant's eligibility for intermediate punishment. For example, under 42 Pa.C.S. § 9763 and § 9804, defendants may be sentenced to intermediate punishment for certain offenses, including summary violations of 75 Pa.C.S. § 1543(b) (driving while license is

under a DUI-related suspension) but only if they meet certain eligibility requirements, such as undergoing a drug and alcohol assessment. Often this information will not be available to the issuing authority at the time of sentencing, especially when the defendant appears personally to enter a guilty plea.

[When the defendant is under 18 years of age at the time of the offense and appears as provided in paragraph (C), if a mandatory sentence of imprisonment is prescribed by statute, the issuing authority must forward the case to the court of common pleas for disposition. See the Juvenile Act, 42 Pa.C.S. §§ 6302 and 6303.]

When the defendant was under 18 years of age at the time of the offense and is charged with a summary offense that would otherwise carry a mandatory sentence of imprisonment as prescribed by statute, the issuing authority shall conduct the trial but the defendant shall not be sentenced to a term of imprisonment. See 42 Pa.C.S. §§ 6302 and 6303 and 75 Pa.C.S. §6303(b).

For procedure upon default in payment of <u>the</u> fine or costs, see Rule 456.

For appeal procedures in summary cases, see Rules 460, 461, and 462.

For procedures regarding arrest warrants, see Rules 430 and 431.

With regard to the defendant's right to counsel and waiver of counsel, see Rules 121 and 122.

NOTE: Previous Rule 59 adopted September 18, 1973, effective January 1, 1974; rescinded July 12, 1985, effective January 1, 1986, and replaced by present Rule 75. Present Rule 59 adopted July 12, 1985, effective January 1, 1986; amended September 23, 1985, effective January 1, 1986. The January 1, 1986 effective dates are all extended to July 1, 1986; amended May 28, 1987, effective July 1, 1987;

amended January 31, 1991, effective July 1, 1991; renumbered Rule 409 and amended March 1, 2000, effective April 1, 2001; *Comment* revised August 7, 2003, effective July 1, 2004; amended January 26, 2007, effective February 1, 2008 [.]; *Comment* revised , 2012, effective , 2012

* * * * * * *

COMMITTEE EXPLANATORY REPORTS:

<u>Report</u> explaining the January 31, 1991 amendments published at 20 <u>Pa.B.</u> 4788 (September 15, 1990); <u>Supplemental</u> <u>Report</u> published at 21 Pa.B. 621 (February 16, 1991).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the March 1, 2000 reorganization and renumbering of the rules published with the Court's Order at 30 <u>Pa.B.</u> 1478 (March 18, 2000).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the August 7, 2003 new <u>Comment</u> language concerning defendants under the age of 18 published with the Court's Order at 33 <u>Pa.B.</u> 4289 (August 30, 2003).

<u>Final Report explaining the January 26, 2007 amendments to paragraphs (A)(2), (B)(3) and (C)(4) published at with the Court's Order at 37 Pa.B.</u> (, 2007).

Report explaining the proposed Comment revision concerning mandatory incarceration offenses and juveniles published for comment at 42 Pa.B. (, 2012).

RULE 414. GUILTY PLEAS.

- (A) A defendant may plead guilty by:
 - (1) notifying the issuing authority in writing of the plea and forwarding to the issuing authority an amount equal to the fine and costs specified in the summons; or
 - (2) appearing before the issuing authority for the entry of the plea and imposition of sentence when the fine and costs are not specified in the summons <u>or after</u> receipt of notice that a guilty plea by mail has not been accepted by the issuing authority pursuant to paragraph (B)(3).
- (B) When the defendant pleads guilty pursuant to paragraph (A)(1):
 - (1) The defendant must sign the guilty plea acknowledging that the plea is entered voluntarily and understandingly.
 - (2) The issuing authority may issue a warrant for the arrest of the defendant as provided in Rules 430 and 431 if the amount forwarded with the plea is less than the amount of the fine and costs specified in the summons.
 - (3) Restrictions on the acceptance of guilty plea by mail:
 - (a) The issuing authority shall not accept a guilty plea that is submitted by mail when the offense carries a mandatory sentence of imprisonment.
 - (b) In those cases in which the charge carries a possible sentence of imprisonment, the issuing authority may accept a guilty plea submitted by mail.
 - (c) In any case in which the issuing authority does not accept a guilty plea submitted by mail, the issuing authority shall notify the defendant (1) that the guilty plea has not been accepted, (2) to appear personally before the issuing authority on a date and time certain, and (3) of the right to counsel. Notice of the rejection of the guilty plea by mail also shall be provided to the affiant.
- (C) When the defendant is required to personally appear before the issuing authority to plead guilty pursuant to paragraph (A)(2) the issuing authority shall:

- (1) advise the defendant of the right to counsel when there is a likelihood of imprisonment and give the defendant, upon request, a reasonable opportunity to secure counsel;
- (2) determine by inquiring of the defendant that the plea is voluntarily and understandingly entered;
- (3) have the defendant sign the plea form with a representation that the plea is entered voluntarily and understandingly;
- (4) impose sentence, or, in cases in which the defendant may be sentenced to intermediate punishment, the issuing authority may delay the proceedings pending confirmation of the defendant's eligibility for intermediate punishment; and
- (5) provide for installment payments when a defendant who is sentenced to pay a fine and costs is without the financial means immediately to pay the fine and costs.

COMMENT: The rule was amended in 2007 to make it clear (1) that a defendant may not enter a guilty plea by mail to an offense that carries a mandatory sentence of imprisonment, and (2) in those cases in which the offense carries a possible sentence of imprisonment, the issuing authority has the discretion whether or not to accept a guilty plea submitted by mail.

Nothing in this rule is intended to require that an issuing authority should proceed as provided in paragraph (C) when the defendant returns the written guilty plea and the fine and costs in person to the issuing authority's office pursuant to paragraphs (A)(1) and (B). The issuing authority's staff should record receipt of the plea and monies in the same manner as those received by mail.

Paragraph (C)(4) was added in 2007 to permit an issuing authority to delay imposition of sentence in order to investigate a defendant's eligibility for intermediate punishment. For example, under 42 Pa.C.S. §9763 and §9804, defendants may be sentenced to intermediate punishment for certain offenses, including summary violations of 75 Pa.C.S. §1543(b) (driving while license is

under a DUI-related suspension) but only if they meet certain eligibility requirements, such as undergoing a drug and alcohol assessment. Often this information will not be available to the issuing authority at the time of sentencing, especially when the defendant appears personally to enter a guilty plea.

[When the defendant is under 18 years of age at the time of the offense and appears as provided in paragraph (C), if a mandatory sentence of imprisonment is prescribed by statute, the issuing authority must forward the case to the court of common pleas for disposition. See the Juvenile Act, 42 Pa.C.S. §§ 6302 and 6303.]

When the defendant was under 18 years of age at the time of the offense and is charged with a summary offense that would otherwise carry a mandatory sentence of imprisonment as prescribed by statute, the issuing authority shall conduct the trial but the defendant shall not be sentenced to a term of imprisonment. See 42 Pa.C.S. §§ 6302 and 6303 and 75 Pa.C.S. §6303(b).

For procedure upon default in payment of the fine or costs, see Rule 456.

For appeal procedures in summary cases, see Rules 460, 461, and 462.

For arrest warrant procedures, see Rules 430 and 431.

With regard to the defendant's right to counsel and waiver of counsel, see Rules 121 and 122.

NOTE: Previous rule, originally numbered Rule 136, adopted January 31, 1970, effective May 1, 1970; renumbered Rule 64 September 18, 1973, effective January 1, 1974; rescinded July 12, 1985, effective January 1, 1986, and replaced by present Rule 84. Present Rule 64 adopted July 12, 1985, effective January 1, 1986; amended September 23, 1985, effective January 1, 1986. The January 1, 1986 effective dates all are extended to July 1,

1986; amended May 28, 1987, effective July 1, 1987; amended January 31, 1991, effective July 1, 1991; renumbered Rule 414 and amended March 1, 2000, effective April 1, 2001; *Comment* revised August 7, 2003, effective July 1, 2004; amended January 26, 2007, effective February 1, 2008 [.] ; *Comment* revised , 2012, effective , 2012.

* * * * * * *

COMMITTEE EXPLANATORY REPORTS:

<u>Report</u> explaining the January 31, 1991 amendments published at 20 <u>Pa.B.</u> 4788 (September 15, 1990); <u>Supplemental</u> <u>Report</u> published at 21 <u>Pa.B.</u> 621 (February 16, 1991).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the March 1, 2000 reorganization and renumbering of the rules published with the Court's Order at 30 <u>Pa.B.</u> 1478 (March 18, 2000).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the August 7, 2002 new <u>Comment</u> language concerning defendants under the age of 18 published with the Court's Order at 33 Pa.B. 4289 (August 30, 2003).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the January 26, 2007 amendments to paragraphs (A)(2), (B)(3) and (C)(4) published at with the Court's Order at 37 <u>Pa.B.</u> (, 2007).

Report explaining the proposed Comment revision concerning mandatory incarceration offenses and juveniles published for comment at 42 Pa.B. (, 2012).

RULE 424. GUILTY PLEAS.

- (A) A defendant may plead guilty by:
 - (1) notifying the issuing authority in writing of the plea and forwarding to the issuing authority an amount equal to the fine and costs specified in the summons; or
 - (2) appearing before the issuing authority for the entry of the plea and imposition of sentence when the fine and costs are not specified in the summons or after receipt of notice that a guilty plea by mail has not been accepted by the issuing authority pursuant to paragraph (B)(3).
- (B) When the defendant pleads guilty pursuant to paragraph (A)(1):
 - (1) The defendant must sign the guilty plea acknowledging that the plea is entered voluntarily and understandingly.
 - (2) The issuing authority may issue a warrant for the arrest of the defendant as provided in Rules 430 and 431 if the amount forwarded with the plea is less than the amount of the fine and costs specified in the summons.
 - (3) Restrictions on the acceptance of guilty plea by mail:
 - (a) The issuing authority shall not accept a guilty plea that is submitted by mail when the offense carries a mandatory sentence of imprisonment.
 - (b) In those cases in which the charge carries a possible sentence of imprisonment, the issuing authority may accept a guilty plea submitted by mail.
 - (c) In any case in which the issuing authority does not accept a guilty plea submitted by mail, the issuing authority shall notify the defendant (1) that the guilty plea has not been accepted, (2) to appear personally before the issuing authority on a date and time certain, and (3) of the right to counsel. Notice of the rejection of the guilty plea by mail also shall be provided to the affiant.
- (C) When the defendant is required to personally appear before the issuing authority to plead guilty pursuant to paragraph (A)(2), the issuing authority shall:

- (1) advise the defendant of the right to counsel when there is a likelihood of imprisonment and give the defendant, upon request, a reasonable opportunity to secure counsel;
- (2) determine by inquiring of the defendant that the plea is voluntarily and understandingly entered;
- (3) have the defendant sign the plea form with a representation that the plea is entered voluntarily and understandingly;
- (4) impose sentence, or, in cases in which the defendant may be sentenced to intermediate punishment, the issuing authority may delay the proceedings pending confirmation of the defendant's eligibility for intermediate punishment; and
- (5) provide for installment payments when a defendant who is sentenced to pay a fine and costs is without the financial means immediately to pay the fine and costs.

COMMENT: The rule was amended in 2007 to make it clear (1) that a defendant may not enter a guilty plea by mail to an offense that carries a mandatory sentence of imprisonment, and (2) in those cases in which the offense carries a possible sentence of imprisonment, the issuing authority has the discretion whether or not to accept a guilty plea submitted by mail.

Nothing in this rule is intended to require that an issuing authority should proceed as provided in paragraph (C) when the defendant returns the written guilty plea and the fine and costs in person to the issuing authority's office pursuant to paragraphs (A)(1) and (B). The issuing authority's staff should record receipt of the plea and monies in the same manner as those received by mail.

Paragraph (C)(4) was added in 2007 to permit an issuing authority to delay imposition of sentence in order to investigate a defendant's eligibility for intermediate punishment. For example, under 42 Pa.C.S. §9763 and §9804, defendants may be sentenced to intermediate punishment for certain offenses, including summary violations of 75 Pa.C.S. §1543(b) (driving while license is

under a DUI-related suspension) but only if they meet certain eligibility requirements, such as undergoing a drug and alcohol assessment. Often this information will not be available to the issuing authority at the time of sentencing, especially when the defendant appears personally to enter a guilty plea.

[When the defendant is under 18 years of age at the time of the offense and appears as provided in paragraph (C), if a mandatory sentence of imprisonment is prescribed by statute, the issuing authority must forward the case to the court of common pleas for disposition. See the Juvenile Act, 42 Pa.C.S. §§ 6302 and 6303.]

When the defendant was under 18 years of age at the time of the offense and is charged with a summary offense that would otherwise carry a mandatory sentence of imprisonment as prescribed by statute, the issuing authority shall conduct the trial but the defendant shall not be sentenced to a term of imprisonment. See 42 Pa.C.S. §§ 6302 and 6303 and 75 Pa.C.S. §6303(b).

For procedure upon default in payment of <u>the</u> fine or costs, see Rule 456.

For appeal procedures in summary cases, see Rules 460, 461, and 462.

For procedures regarding arrest warrants, see Rules 430 and 431.

With regard to the defendant's right to counsel and waiver of counsel, see Rules 121 and 122.

NOTE: Previous rule, originally numbered Rule 140, adopted January 31, 1970, effective May 1, 1970; renumbered Rule 69 September 18, 1973, effective January 1, 1974; *Comment* revised January 28, 1983, effective July 1, 1983; rescinded July 12, 1985, effective January 1, 1986, and not replaced in these rules. Present Rule 69 adopted July 12, 1985, effective January 1, 1986; amended

September 23, 1985, effective January 1, 1986. The January 1, 1986 effective dates are all extended to July 1, 1986; amended May 28, 1987, effective July 1, 1987; amended January 31, 1991, effective July 1, 1991; renumbered Rule 424 and amended March 1, 2000, effective April 1, 2001; *Comment* revised August 7, 2003, effective July 1, 2004; amended January 26, 2007, effective February 1, 2008 [.] : *Comment* revised , 2012, effective , 2012.

* * * * * *

COMMITTEE EXPLANATORY REPORTS:

<u>Report</u> explaining the January 31, 1991 amendments published at 20 <u>Pa.B.</u> 4788 (September 15, 1990); <u>Supplemental</u> <u>Report</u> published at 21 <u>Pa.B.</u> 621 (February 16, 1991).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the March 1, 2000 reorganization and renumbering of the rules published with the Court's Order at 30 Pa.B. 1478 (March 18, 2000).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the August 7, 2003 new <u>Comment</u> language concerning defendants under the age of 18 published with the Court's Order at 33 <u>Pa.B.</u> 4289 (August 30, 2003).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the January 26, 2007 amendments to paragraphs (A)(2), (B)(3) and (C)(4) published at with the Court's Order at 37 <u>Pa.B.</u> (, 2007).

Report explaining the proposed Comment revision concerning mandatory incarceration offenses and juveniles published for comment at 42 Pa.B. (, 2012).

RULE 454. TRIAL IN SUMMARY CASES.

- (A) Immediately prior to trial in a summary case:
 - (1) the defendant shall be advised of the charges in the citation or complaint;
 - (2) if, in the event of a conviction, there is a reasonable likelihood of a sentence of imprisonment or probation, the defendant shall be advised of the right to counsel and
 - (a) upon request, the defendant shall be given a reasonable opportunity to secure counsel, or
 - (b) if the defendant is without financial resources or is otherwise unable to employ counsel, counsel shall be assigned as provided in Rule 122; and
 - (3) the defendant shall enter a plea.
- (B) If the defendant pleads guilty, the issuing authority shall impose sentence. If the defendant pleads not guilty, the issuing authority shall try the case in the same manner as trials in criminal cases are conducted in the courts of common pleas when jury trial has been waived; however, in all summary cases arising under the Vehicle Code or local traffic ordinances, the law enforcement officer observing the defendant's alleged offense may, but shall not be required to, appear and testify against the defendant. In no event shall the failure of the law enforcement officer to appear, by itself, be a basis for dismissal of the charges against the defendant.
- (C) The attorney for the Commonwealth may appear and assume charge of the prosecution. When the violation of an ordinance of a municipality is charged, an attorney representing that municipality, with the consent of the attorney for the Commonwealth, may appear and assume charge of the prosecution. When no attorney appears on behalf of the Commonwealth, the affiant may be permitted to ask questions of any witness who testifies.
- (D) The verdict and sentence, if any, shall be announced in open court immediately upon the conclusion of the trial, except as provided in paragraph (E).
- (E) If the defendant may be sentenced to intermediate punishment, the issuing authority may delay imposing sentence pending confirmation of the defendant's eligibility for intermediate punishment.

- (F) At the time of sentencing, the issuing authority shall:
 - (1) if the defendant's sentence includes restitution, a fine, or costs, state the date on which payment is due. If the defendant is without the financial means to pay the amount in a single remittance, the issuing authority may provide for installment payments and shall state the date on which each installment is due;
 - (2) advise the defendant of the right to appeal within 30 days for a trial *de novo* in the court of common pleas, and that if an appeal is filed:
 - (a) the execution of sentence will be stayed and the issuing authority may set bail or collateral; and
 - (b) the defendant must appear for the *de novo* trial or the appeal may be dismissed;
 - (3) if a sentence of imprisonment has been imposed, direct the defendant to appear for the execution of sentence on a date certain unless the defendant files a notice of appeal within the 30-day period, and advise that, if the defendant fails to appear on that date, a warrant for the defendant's arrest will be issued; and
 - (4) issue a written order imposing sentence, signed by the issuing authority. The order shall include the information specified in paragraphs (F)(1) through (F)(3), and a copy of the order shall be given to the defendant.

COMMENT: No defendant may be sentenced to imprisonment or probation if the right to counsel was not afforded at trial. See Alabama v. Shelton, 535 U.S. 654 (2002), Scott v. Illinois, 440 U.S. 367 (1979), and Argersinger v. Hamlin, 407 U.S. 25 (1972). See Rules 121 and 122.

The affiant may be permitted to withdraw the charges pending before the issuing authority. See Rule 457 (Withdrawal of Charges in Summary Cases).

Paragraph (F)(2)(b) is included in the rule in light of *North v. Russell*, 427 U.S. 328 (1976). For the procedures for taking, perfecting, and handling an appeal, see Rules 460, 461, and 462.

As the judicial officer presiding at the summary trial, the issuing authority controls the conduct of the trial generally. When an attorney appears on behalf of the Commonwealth or on behalf of a municipality pursuant to paragraph (C), the prosecution of the case is under the control of that attorney. When no attorney appears at the summary trial on behalf of the Commonwealth, or a municipality, the issuing authority may ask questions of any witness who testifies, and the affiant may request the issuing authority to ask specific questions. In the appropriate circumstances, the issuing authority may also permit the affiant to question Commonwealth witnesses, cross-examine defense witnesses, and make recommendations about the case to the issuing authority.

Although the scheduling of summary trials is left by the rules to the discretion of the issuing authority, it is intended that trial will be scheduled promptly upon receipt of a defendant's plea or promptly after a defendant's arrest. When a defendant is incarcerated pending a summary trial, it is incumbent upon the issuing authority to schedule trial for the earliest possible time.

[When the defendant was under 18 years of age at the time of the offense, if a mandatory sentence of imprisonment is prescribed by statute, the issuing authority may not conduct the trial, but must forward the case to the court of common pleas for disposition. See the Juvenile Act, 42 Pa.C.S. §§ 6302 and 6303.]

When the defendant was under 18 years of age at the time of the offense and is charged with a summary offense that would otherwise carry a mandatory sentence of imprisonment as prescribed by statute, the issuing authority shall conduct the trial but the defendant shall not be sentenced to a term of imprisonment. See 42 Pa.C.S. §§ 6302 and 6303 and 75 Pa.C.S. §6303(b).

Under paragraph (F)(2)(a), the issuing authority should explain to the defendant that if an appeal is filed, any sentence, including imprisonment, fines, or restitution, will be stayed.

When setting the specific date for the defendant to appear for execution of a sentence of imprisonment pursuant to paragraph (F)(3), the issuing authority should set the earliest possible date for sentencing after the appeal period expires.

When a defendant has waived the stay of the sentence of imprisonment pursuant to Rule 461, the issuing authority may fix the commencement date of the sentence to be the date of conviction, rather than after the 30-day stay period has expired. The defendant, of course, still would be able to pursue an appeal under Rules 460-462.

For the statutory authority to sentence a defendant to pay a fine, see 42 Pa.C.S. § 9726.

For the statutory authority to sentence a defendant to pay restitution, see 42 Pa.C.S. § 9721(c) and 18 Pa.C.S. § 1106(c). See also 18 Pa.C.S. § 1106(c)(2)(iv), which prohibits the court from ordering the incarceration of a defendant for failure to pay restitution if the failure results from the defendant's inability to pay.

Before imposing both a fine and restitution, the issuing authority must determine that the fine will not prevent the defendant from making restitution to the victim. See 42 Pa.C.S. §§ 9726(c)(2) and 9730(b)(3).

Paragraph (E) permits an issuing authority to delay imposing sentence in summary cases in order to investigate a defendant's eligibility for intermediate punishment. For example, under 42 Pa.C.S. § 9763 and § 9804, defendants may be sentenced to intermediate punishment for certain offenses, including summary violations of 75 Pa.C.S. § 1543(b) (driving while license is under a DUI-related suspension) but only if they meet certain eligibility requirements, such as undergoing a drug and alcohol assessment. Often this information will not be available to the issuing authority at the time of sentencing.

See Rule 456 for the procedures when a defendant defaults in the payment of restitution, fines, or costs.

A defendant should be encouraged to seek an adjustment of a payment schedule for restitution, fines, or costs before a default occurs. See Rule 456(A).

NOTE: Rule 83 adopted July 12, 1985, effective January 1, 1986; amended September 23, 1985, effective January 1, 1986; January 1, 1986 effective dates extended to July 1, 1986; amended February 2, 1989, effective March 1, 1989; amended October 28, 1994, effective as to cases instituted on or after January 1, 1995; *Comment* revised April 18, 1997, effective July 1, 1997; amended October 1, 1997, effective October 1, 1998; *Comment* revised February 13, 1998, effective July 1, 1998; renumbered Rule 454 and *Comment* revised March 1, 2000, effective April 1, 2001; amended February 28, 2003, effective July 1, 2003; *Comment* revised August 7, 2003, effective July 1, 2004; amended March 26, 2004, effective July 1, 2004; amended January 26, 2007, effective February 1, 2008 [.]; *Comment* revised , 2012, effective , 2012.

* * * * * *

COMMITTEE EXPLANATORY REPORTS:

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the October 28, 1994 amendments published with the Court's Order at 24 <u>Pa.B.</u> 5841 (November 26, 1994).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the April 18, 1997 <u>Comment</u> revision cross-referencing new Rule 87 published with the Court's Order at 27 <u>Pa.B.</u> 2119 (May 3, 1997).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the October 1, 1997 amendments to paragraph (E) and the <u>Comment</u> concerning the procedures at the time of sentencing published with the Court's Order at 27 <u>Pa.B.</u> 5414 (October 18, 1997).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the February 13, 1998 <u>Comment</u> revision concerning questioning of witnesses published with the Court's Order at 28 <u>Pa.B.</u> 1127 (February 28, 1998).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the March 1, 2000 reorganization and renumbering of the rules published with the Court's Order at 30 <u>Pa.B.</u> 1478 (March 18, 2000).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the February 28, 2003 amendments published with the Court's Order at 33 <u>Pa.B.</u> 1326 (March 15, 2003).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the August 7, 2003 changes to the <u>Comment</u> concerning defendants under the age of 18 published with the Court's Order at 33 <u>Pa.B.</u> 4293 (August 30, 2003).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the March 26, 2004 changes concerning <u>Alabama v. Shelton</u> published with the Court's Order at 34 <u>Pa.B.</u> 1929 (April 10, 2004).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the January 26, 2007 amendments adding paragraph (E) concerning intermediate punishment published with the Court's Order at 37 <u>Pa.B.</u> (, 2007).

Report explaining the proposed Comment revision concerning mandatory incarceration offenses and juveniles published for comment at 42 Pa.B. (, 2012).

RULE 455. TRIAL IN DEFENDANT'S ABSENCE.

- (A) If the defendant fails to appear for trial in a summary case, the trial shall be conducted in the defendant's absence, unless the issuing authority determines that there is a likelihood that the sentence will be imprisonment or that there is other good cause not to conduct the trial in the defendant's absence. If the trial is not conducted in the defendant's absence, the issuing authority may issue a warrant for the defendant's arrest.
- (B) At trial, the issuing authority shall proceed to determine the facts and render a verdict.
- (C) If the defendant is found not guilty, any collateral previously deposited shall be returned.
- (D) If the defendant is found guilty, the issuing authority shall impose sentence, and shall give notice by first class mail to the defendant of the conviction and sentence, and of the right to file an appeal within 30 days for a trial *de novo*. In those cases in which the amount of collateral deposited does not satisfy the fine and costs imposed or the issuing authority imposes a sentence of restitution, the notice shall also state that failure within 10 days of the date on the notice to pay the amount due or to appear for a hearing to determine whether the defendant is financially able to pay the amount due may result in the issuance of an arrest warrant.
- (E) Any collateral previously deposited shall be forfeited and applied only to the payment of the fine and costs. When the amount of collateral deposited is more than the fine and costs, the balance shall be returned to the defendant.
- (F) If the defendant does not respond within 10 days to the notice in paragraph (D), the issuing authority may issue a warrant for the defendant's arrest.

COMMENT: In those cases in which the issuing authority determines that there is a likelihood that the sentence will be imprisonment or that there is other good cause not to conduct the trial in the defendant's absence, the issuing authority may issue a warrant for the arrest of the defendant in order to have the defendant brought before the issuing authority for the summary trial. See Rule 430(B). The trial would then be conducted with the defendant present as provided in these rules. See Rule 454.

[When the defendant was under 18 years of age at the time of the offense, if a mandatory sentence of imprisonment is prescribed by statute, the issuing authority may not conduct the trial, but must forward the

case to the court of common pleas for disposition. See the Juvenile Act, 42 Pa.C.S. §§ 6302 and 6303.]

When the defendant was under 18 years of age at the time of the offense and is charged with a summary offense that would otherwise carry a mandatory sentence of imprisonment as prescribed by statute, the issuing authority shall conduct the trial but the defendant shall not be sentenced to a term of imprisonment. See 42 Pa.C.S. §§ 6302 and 6303 and 75 Pa.C.S. §6303(b).

Paragraph (D) provides notice to the defendant of conviction and sentence after trial *in absentia* to alert the defendant that the time for filing an appeal has begun to run. See Rule 413(B)(3).

If the defendant is under 18 years of age, the notice in paragraph (D) must inform the defendant and defendant's parents, guardian, or other custodian that, if payment is not received or the defendant does not appear within the 10-day time period, the issuing authority will certify notice of the failure to pay to the court of common pleas as required by the Juvenile Act, 42 Pa.C.S. § 6302, definition of "delinquent act," paragraph (2)(iv), and the case will proceed pursuant to the Rules of Juvenile Court Procedure and the Juvenile Act instead of these rules.

If the defendant is 18 years of age or older and fails to pay or appear as required in paragraph (D), the issuing authority must proceed under these rules.

For the defendant's right to counsel, see Rule 122.

For arrest warrant procedures in summary cases, see Rules 430 and 431.

NOTE: Rule 84 adopted July 12, 1985, effective January 1, 1986; January 1, 1986 effective date extended to July 1, 1986; amended February 1, 1989, effective July 1, 1989; amended April 18, 1997, effective July 1, 1997; amended October 1, 1997, effective October 1, 1998; renumbered Rule 455 and *Comment* revised March 1, 2000, effective April 1, 2001; *Comment* revised August 7, 2003, effective July 1, 2004; *Comment* revised April 1, 2005, effective

October 1, 2005; amended August 15, 2005 effective February 1, 2006 [.] ; *Comment revised*, 2012, effective, 2012.

* * * * * *

COMMITTEE EXPLANATORY REPORTS:

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the April 18, 1997 amendments mandating a summary trial <u>in absentia</u> with certain exceptions published with the Court's Order at 27 <u>Pa.B.</u> 2117 (May 3, 1997).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the October 1, 1997 amendments to paragraphs (D) and (E) published with the Court's Order at 27 <u>Pa.B.</u> 5414 (October 1, 1997).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the March 1, 2000 reorganization and renumbering of the rules published with the Court's Order at 30 <u>Pa.B.</u> 1478 (March 18, 2000).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the August 7, 2003 changes to the <u>Comment</u> concerning failure to pay and juveniles published with the Court's Order at 33 <u>Pa.B.</u> 4293 (August 30, 2003).

<u>Final Report</u> explaining the April 1, 2005 <u>Comment</u> revision concerning application of the Juvenile Court Procedural Rules published with the Court's Order at 35 <u>Pa.B.</u> 2213 (April 16, 2005).

<u>Final Report explaining the August 15, 2005 amendments to paragraph (D) concerning notice of right to appeal published with the Court's Order at 35 Pa.B.</u> (, 2005).

Report explaining the proposed Comment revision concerning mandatory incarceration offenses and juveniles published for comment at 42 Pa.B. (. 2012).

REPORT

Proposed Revisions to the <u>Comments</u> to Pa.Rs.Crim.P. 409, 414, 424, 454, and 455

JUVENILES AND MANDATORY INCARCERATION IN SUMMARY CASES

The Committee has recently examined a possible conflict between the Rule 454 *Comment* and provisions within the Juvenile Act regarding the handling of summary offenses for which there is a mandatory sentence of incarceration when the defendant is a juvenile.

The particular *Comment* language in question states:

When the defendant was under 18 years of age at the time of the offense, if a mandatory sentence of imprisonment is prescribed by statute, the issuing authority may not conduct the trial, but must forward the case to the court of common pleas for disposition. See the Juvenile Act, 42 Pa.C.S.§§6302 and 6303.

This language was added as part of a package developed by the Committee that was adopted by the Court in 2004. The *Comment* language above addressed the provision in the Juvenile Act, 42 Pa.C.S.§6303(b) that states:

(b) Minor judiciary.--No child shall be detained, committed or sentenced to imprisonment by a magisterial district judge or a judge of the minor judiciary unless the child is charged with an act set forth in paragraph (2)(i), (ii), (iii) or (v) of the definition of "delinquent act" in section 6302 (relating to definitions).

42 Pa.C.S. §6302 excludes summary offenses from the definition of "delinquent act."

The language was added to the Rule 454 *Comment* to provide guidance to magisterial district judges (MDJs) on how to dispose of summary cases

involving juveniles facing possible mandatory incarceration.¹ The Committee believed that sending these cases to the common pleas court created the least confusion while ensuring no juvenile would be sentenced to imprisonment by a member of the minor judiciary.

Shortly after these changes were adopted, the Legislature passed amendments to 75 Pa.C.S. §6303 (Rights and Liabilities of Minors), so that it now reads:

- (a) Except as provided in subsection (b), any person over the age of 16 years charged with the violation of any provisions of this title constituting a summary offense shall have all the rights of an adult and may be prosecuted under the provisions of this title in the same manner as an adult.
- (b) No person shall be sentenced to a term of imprisonment for a violation of any provisions of this title constituting a summary offense committed while the person was under the age of 18 years.

It has come to the attention of the Committee that the practice in some counties in cases in which the defendant is a juvenile charged with violations of 75 Pa.C.S. §1543(b) is for magisterial district judges (MDJs) to hold the summary trial with the sentence for §1543(b) offenses being limited to fines only, and no sentence to incarceration being imposed.

The problem was brought to light because the recently redesigned Magisterial District Court System, relying on the language in the Rule 454 *Comment*, will not permit an MDJ to schedule the summary trial. However, when the MDJs have tried to transfer these cases to the common pleas juvenile court, the juvenile court has rejected these cases because, as noted above, the Juvenile Act excludes summary offenses from the definition of "delinquent acts" and summary cases are not within the jurisdiction of the juvenile court.

_

¹ The only summary offense for which there was then, and is now, a sentence of mandatory incarceration is driving under a DUI-related suspended license as provided in 75 Pa.C.S. §1543(b) .

The Committee concluded that these cases should be heard before the MDJs. Since the mandatory sentence required by Section 1543(b) now cannot be imposed on a juvenile, there is no need for the case to be referred to the court of common pleas and it can be treated in the same manner as other summary charges against juveniles.

The Committee is proposing the revision to the Rule 454 *Comment* that would specifically state that the magisterial district judge shall try the summary offense but that no incarceration could be awarded to a defendant under the age of 18. Although this question arose concerning Rule 454, identical language is contained in Rule 409, 414, 424, and 455. Similar changes are proposed to be made to the *Comments* to each of those rules.